

# MANAGING ETHNIC DIVERSITY AND FEDERALISM IN PAKISTAN

By: Qaisar Iqbal (SZABIST islamabad)

# Definitions



- **ETHNICITY:**

The fact or state of belonging to a social group that has a common national or cultural tradition.

"the interrelationship between gender, ethnicity, and class."

Ethnic traits, background, allegiance, or association

# Definitions



- **Federalism:**

The federal principle or system of government.

"idealists who were committed to European federalism."

Central Government with power sharing states or Provinces.

e.g. USA, **Pakistan** and India etc

# Introduction



- **Ethnic Diversity:**
- Multicultural ideologies or policies vary widely, ranging from the advocacy of equal respect to the various cultures in a society,
- To a policy of promoting the maintenance of cultural **diversity**,
- To policies in which people of various **ethnic** and religious groups are addressed by the authorities as defined by the group.

# Continue ...



- Since developed as well as developing countries are experiencing ethnic tensions.
- Ethnic mobilization and conflicts are not new phenomenon but their contemporary globe manifestation in frequency and intensity is a new development, which needs careful reflection and detailed examination.
- Since more than 90 percent of the nations states are heterogeneous and this heterogeneity is likely to increase as a result of global migration patterns.
- ethnic conflicts and the resultant political tensions are likely to become even more pervasive in the coming years. This global manifestation of ethnicity has attracted significant attention from social scientists.

# Ethnic Diversity In Pakistan



- Pakistan is a multiethnic state. Each of its provinces is associated with a certain linguistic group.
- Punjab with Punjabis.
- Sindh with Sindhis.
- Balochistan with Balochs.
- And North Western Frontier Province (KPK) with Pashtuns.
- Kashmir with kashmiris.
- GB with Sheyn, Yashkuns.

# Province Wise.



- There are ethnic and linguistic divisions within every federating unit.
- Sind is the most ethnically diverse province of Pakistan. Mohajirs form the majority in urban Sind. Sindhis dominate the rural Sind. Still, Pashtuns, Punjabis and Baloch also live in Sind.
- Baluchistan is the home province of Balochs and Pashtuns. There is also a considerable number of Siraikis and Sindhis in Baluchistan as well and About 1 million Hazaras living in Baluchistan and Pakistan.


## Continue..



- Punjab is also a no more homogenous province despite a Punjabi dominance within the Province a considerable number of Siraikis are residing in southern part of the Province.
- Pashtuns also live in Punjab, And also Tribal Punjabi's Of Mianwali and other Districts.
- KPK(NWFP) also hosts Hindko speaking and Siraiki populations as well. And Kohistani's, Chitrali's and Kalash people are also inhabited in Northern parts of province.



# Pakistan by mother language (1998)



Linguistic Group.	Pakistan.	Punjab.	Sind.	KPK.	Baluchistan.
Urdu.	7.8	4.5	21.1	0.8	1.6
Punjabi	45.4	75.2	7.0	1.0	2.9
Pashto	13.0	1.2	4.2	73.9	23.0
Sindhi	14.6	0.1	59.7	0	6.8
Balochi	3.5	0.7	2.1	0	58.5
Siraiki	10.9	17.4	1.0	3.9	2.6
Others	4.8	0.9	4.9	20.4	5.1
Total	100	100	100	100	10
Population in Million	127.5	73.6	30.4	17.7	5.7

# Seperationist Movements In Pakistan



- **Bengalis Separation:**
- The Muslims of Bengal decided to join Pakistan in 1947, at the moment of decolonization and division of the India.
- The non-muslim members of the Bengal assembly voted for the division of Bengal.
- Therefore, the west Bengal – Hindu majority area joined India and the East Bengal – Muslim majority area – joined Pakistan.
- Despite its division, Bengal remained the most populous province of Pakistan.
- It had more population than the total population of all federating units and princely states of western wing.

# Continue..



- The constitutional assembly was assigned the role to formulate the constitution of Pakistan.
- Debates in the constitutional assembly over the constitutional formulas resulted into distrust between the members from Bengal and the western wing. Bengalis had concerns regarding certain issues – such as lingua franca and representation in national legislature – during the constitution making process.
- Contrary to their counterpart in Punjab, they demanded for autonomy and decentralization of political power.
- On the whole, their demands were not entertained

## Continue..



- The Politicization of the Bengalis grievances and the ‘inability or unwillingness of the central government to devolve authority’, led to the separatist and autonomous demands and eventually the separation of East Pakistan.
- Now a days it is the same case in KARACHI, the Economic hub of Pakistan also Mini Pakistan, there are many issue like Ethnic Diversity law and order situation but the major one is of Lingua.

# The Pashtun Separatism



- The Pashtuns of North-West Frontier Province (NWFP) had a strong sense of distinctiveness. The ‘Khudai Khidmatgar’ (servants of Gods) movement of Pashtun nationalists had a popular rural base in predominantly Pashtun districts of the KPK(NWFP).
- It won both the provincial elections of 1937 and 1946 and formed the provincial governments

# Continue...



- Pakhtunistan (Pashtunistan) means ‘different things to different people,
- Ranging from the demand for the formation of a new state incorporating Pathan areas on both sides of the Pakistan Afghanistan border to mere change of nomenclature for the KPK.
- Soon after the creation of Pakistan, the Pashtuns stressed that by ‘Pashtunistan’ they meant regional autonomy of NWFP Afterwards, the temporal (April 1972- February 1973) sharing of power with Pashtuns under the tripartite accord pursued Pashtun nationalist to left the Pashtunistan issue.
- (In the general elections of 1970 the Pakistan Peoples Party of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto got victory in the Punjab and Sindh. Jamiat-ul-ulmai Islam (JUI) and National Awami Party (NAP) – the representative of Pashtun and Baloch nationalists – were the leading parties in NWFP and Balochistan.

# Continue....



- . The three leading parties entered into the tripartite accord and decided to respect the mandate of each party in its respective jurisdiction.).Abdul Ghaffar Khan – who previously demanded a separate homeland for Pashtuns – declared, ‘Our demand for Pashtunistan has been fulfilled.’
- Islamabad dismissed the NAP (National Awami Party) government in Balochistan. The coalition government of NWFP resigned as a protest against the dismissal of Balochistan government.
- The central government banned the NAP alleging that it had been working against the integrity of the country

## Continue....



- The Baloch waged a war against the dissolution of provincial government and Pashtuns pursued ban on NAP by challenging the decision in Supreme Court. Accordingly, the Pashtun nationalist feelings resurfaced once again.
- On a question whether he was, ‘a Muslim, a Pakistani or a Pashtun first’, Wali Khan claimed that he was, “a six thousands years old Pashtun, a thousand years old Muslim and 27 years old Pakistani”



# Continue..



- Meanwhile, the gradual migration of Pashtuns into Karachi and urban centers of Punjab resulted in their 'dominance in privately owned transport sector' and larger share in employment.
- They acquired the share in the Pakistani power-structure and the 'primary source of incorporation remained the army. The majority of Pashtun soldiers and officials whom got jobs belong to the areas that had traditionally been 'stronghold of the pashtunistan movement'
- This incorporation and accommodation of the Pashtuns in the power-structure resulted in the decline of the pashtunistan movement. This decline led to the argument that 'Pashtun Movement had died down
- After 9/11 war against terror has changed the chemistry of the region. ANP has emerged as a single largest party in the wounded constituency. The verity that Pashtuns, on both sides of the border, had been questioning the legality of the Durand line makes the case more interesting.

# Sindhi Regionalism



- The Sind province restored its provincial status in 1936 when it was separated from Bombay.
- Though Sind was a Muslim majority province, the Muslim League did not find any candidate to contest in the 1937 elections.
- G. M. Sayeed and Sheikh Abdul Majeed, then the members of Sind assembly, joined the party in 1938 and managed to pass the resolution for a separate homeland for the Muslims of sub-continent in the same year.
- The Muslim league succeeded to govern Sind in 1942 and Sind Assembly passed a resolution on 3rd March 1943 favouring the Lahore Resolution 1940.
- Finally, Sind Assembly decided to join Pakistan by 33 votes to 20

# Continue..



- Though the pre-partition Sind was not an ‘ethnically pure region’, there was no substantial antagonism by the Sindhis against the Baloch and Punjabi settlers.
- These people adopted Sindhi language and were ‘assimilated into the Sind culture.
- On the contrary, the Sindhis were worried in 1947 about the influx of ‘millions of well-educated, mobile and resourceful Muhajireens (refugees: Mohajirs)’.
- The Sind government resisted against the policy of central government and as a result, Ayub Khuhro, Chief Minister of Sindh was dismissed by the Governor on the recommendations of central government.
- Resultantly, the huge influx of Mohajirs continued in Sindh and it changed the ‘demographic, political and economic contours of Pakistani Sind’ in Mohajirs favors

## Continue..



- The Removal of Bhutto government in 1977 and finally his execution through a judicial trial by Punjabi dominated Supreme Court bench in 1979 produced nationalist feelings in the rural Sind once again.
- These nationalistic feelings gained momentum during the MRD's (Movement for Restoration of Democracy) national campaign against the military dictatorship of Zia-ul-Haq. A Punjabi-Pakhtoon Dominating army.
- The articulation of regional aspirations was formulated in the demand for a confederation, outlined by the ex-governor of Sind, Mumtaz Bhutto.

# Mohajir Identity Politics



- The Punjabis and Mohajirs dominated the politics in the early years of Pakistan. While Punjabis remained over-represented in the army and administration, Mohajirs dominated the civil bureaucracy and political decision making centres .
- This relative privileged position of the Mohajirs led them to identify themselves with the Pakistani state and Islamic ideology, and to hostile towards regional ethnic movements.
- Conversely, in Post-Liaquat Era (1951) ‘Mohajirs gradually lost grounds to Punjabis’.
- In addition, the Military coup of Ayub Khan in 1958 ‘initiated a new PathanPunjabi axis’ and hence ‘those (Mohajirs) who regarded themselves as makers of the Pakistan had begun to recede to the background

# Continue..



- The rise of MQM (Mohajir Qaumi Movement or Mohajir National Movement) in 1984, on the national scene was quite sudden and dramatic.
- It is ‘an urban, youthful and organisationally well-knit party’. Its leadership and most of its activists represent the lower middle class who have experienced unemployment Since late 1980s, MQM remained dominant in the urban Sind.
- It has been achieved remarkable electoral support in Karachi and Hyderabad (the major urban centres of Sind).
- Although MQM (Mohajir Qaumi Movement or Mohajir National Movement) has been renamed MQM (Muttahida Qaumi Movement or Joint National Movement)

# Baloch Nationalism



- The Colonial period Balochistan, includes British Balochistan (Pashtun majority areas and the BugtiMarri tribal areas), Kalat state and states of Kharan, Makran and Lasbella.
- The ruler of Kalat state, Mir Ahmad Yar Khan, declared independence, on August 15, 1947, a day after Pakistan was formally established. Both houses of the Kalat Assembly had endorsed this decision and rejected accession with Pakistan.
- But, ultimately Khan had to signed accession papers to join Pakistan. The Baloch nationalists resisted against the decision, and Prince Abdul Karim started an armed movement in the Jhalawan area

# Continue..



- The Baloch and Pashtun Nationalist contested in the first general elections of the Pakistani history in 1970 under the banner of NAP (National Awami Party).
- **Attaullah Mengal's** government was dismissed in February 1973 on the grounds of lawlessness and failure to comply with central government directives. This dismal sparked a sharper confrontation with the centre and led to an insurgency that remained at its peak from 1973 to 1977.
- Due to another military rule (Musharraf), deprived of representative participatory institutions and with their natural resources exploited by Islamabad, Baloch alienation is at an all-time high.
- Although regional parties and leaders are still struggling to obtain political, economic and social rights within a democratic, federal, parliamentary framework, militants have picked up the gun



## Continue...



- Military action and conciliatory efforts remained simultaneously intact in Balochistan.
- Due to military involvement in the case, parliamentary committee remained unable to implement its recommendations.
- Bugti's (Baloch leader who previously remained governor and then chief minister of Balochistan) personal resistance provided fuel to the flames of the conflict.

# Siraiki Movement



- Within Punjab, three well-known groups/regions may be recognized on the linguistic and geographical basis – the Punjabi speaking, central Punjab.
- The Pothowhari speaking, northern Punjab; and the Siraiki speaking, southern Punjab.
- The ‘civil-military officers, administrators and businessmen from the central and the northern Punjab, together make ‘the Punjabi ruling group.

## Continue..



- Siraiki political parties had no appeal for the majority of Siraiki speaking people.
- Despite their efforts to build up support for Siraiki movement by stressing the marginalization of Siraiki speaking community, they lacked electoral support and performed badly in various general and local elections.
- This survey of ethno-nationalist movements suggests that it was the policy of centralization that created a sense of Punjabi domination and marginality in smaller units of the federation.
- The Punjabi dominated federal authorities intervened and dismissed various provincial governments ignoring their right of self-governance

# Federation Of Pakistan



- Federation of Pakistan consist of 4 Provinces.
- Namely
  - I. Punjab
  - II. Sind
  - III. KPK
  - IV. Baluchistan
- Some other Federal Administrative units of Pakistan are,
- FATA, Gilgit-Baltistan, AJK and ICT

# MANAGING ETHNIC DIVERSITY AND FEDERALISM



- What Actually Federalism means,
- Sharing of Resources and Distribution of power.
- Philosophy of federalism should be followed actually in its real meaning.
- Justice
- Equal Distribution of Resources
- **Equitable** distribution of wealth
- Respect and Recognition of each and every Ethnic group.

# CONCLUSION



- The analysis of constitutional and political history of Pakistan suggests that although Pakistan is a formal federal system and fulfill minimum requirements of the federalism, the system relatively operate as a unitary system. e.g. Ayub khan, ZA Bhutto, M Zia, Musharaf.
- The paper suggests that management of diversity in Pakistan requires a process of political negotiation and has to go hand in hand with the strengthening and deepening of the democratic process.



# **SUGGESTIONs and QUESTIONS**

**Thank you**